



TO: Audit & Governance Committee

FROM: Head of Audit & Assurance

DATE: 10 January 2017

PORTFOLIOS AFFECTED: All

WARDS AFFECTED: All

TITLE OF REPORT Arrangements for the Appointment of External Auditors

1. PURPOSE

- 1.1 To set out the proposals for appointing the external auditor to the Council for the 2018/19 accounts and beyond following the end of the transitional arrangements at the conclusion of the 2017/18 audits. The auditors are currently working under a contract originally let by the Audit Commission and the contract was novated to Public Sector Audit Appointments (PSAA) following the closure of the Audit Commission.
- 1.2 The Council will need to put new arrangements in place to make a first appointment by 31 December 2017 for the audit year 2018/19.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 The Committee is asked to note the preferred option for the provision of external audit services from 2018/19 and propose it for approval by Finance Council, namely:
- The Council accepts the PSAA invitation to 'opt in' to the sector led option for the appointment of external auditors for five financial years commencing 1 April 2018.

3. BACKGROUND

- 3.1 The Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 (the Act) brought to a close the Audit Commission and established transitional arrangements for the appointment of external auditors and the setting of audit fees for all local government and NHS bodies in England. On 5 October 2015 the Secretary of State Communities and Local Government (CLG) determined that the transitional arrangements for local government bodies would be extended by one year to also include the audit of the accounts for 2017/18.
- 3.2 The Act also set out the arrangements for the appointment of auditors for subsequent years, with the opportunity for authorities to make their own decisions about how and by whom their auditors are appointed. The options under the Act are to establish our own independent audit panel to make a stand-alone appointment or join with other authorities to establish a joint

appointment. Alternatively, Regulations made under the Act allow authorities to 'opt in' for their auditor to be appointed by an 'appointing person'.

- 3.3 In July 2016 PSAA were specified by the Secretary of State as an appointing person under Regulation 3 of the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015. The appointing person is sometimes referred to as the sector led body and PSAA has wide support across local government. PSAA was originally established to operate the transitional arrangements following the closure of the Audit Commission under powers delegated by the Secretary of State. PSAA is an independent, not-for-profit company limited by guarantee and established by the LGA
- 3.4 PSAA is inviting the Council to opt in, along with all other authorities, so that it can enter into a number of contracts with appropriately qualified audit firms and appoint a suitable firm to be the Council auditor.
- 3.5 The principal benefits from such an approach are as follows:
- PSAA will ensure the appointment of a suitably qualified and registered auditor and expects to be able to manage the appointments to allow for appropriate groupings and clusters of audits where bodies work together;
 - PSAA will monitor contract delivery and ensure compliance with contractual, audit quality and independence requirements;
 - Any auditor conflicts at individual authorities would be managed by PSAA who would have a number of contracted firms to call upon;
 - It is expected that the large-scale contracts procured through PSAA will bring economies of scale and attract keener prices from the market than a smaller scale competition;
 - The overall procurement costs would be lower than an individual smaller scale local procurement;
 - The overhead costs for managing the contracts will be minimised through a smaller number of large contracts across the sector;
 - There will be no need for the Council to establish alternative appointment processes locally, including the need to set up and manage an 'auditor panel';
 - The new regime provides both the perception and reality of independent auditor appointment through a collective approach; and
 - A sustainable market for audit provision in the sector will be easier to ensure for the future.
- 3.6 Apart from two district councils all the other Lancashire councils are planning to take this option.
- 3.7 The Council's current external auditor is Grant Thornton, this appointment having been made under at a contract let by the Audit Commission. Following closure of the Audit Commission the contract was novated to PSAA, and since this date PSAA has demonstrated its capability in terms of auditor appointment, contract management, and monitoring audit quality. Over recent years authorities have benefited from a reduction in fees in the order of 55% compared with fees in 2012. This has been the result of a combination of factors including new contracts negotiated nationally with the audit firms and

savings from closure of the Audit Commission. The Council current external audit fees are £102,839 per annum.

- 3.8 The proposed fees for the subsequent years cannot be known until the procurement process has been completed, as the costs will depend on proposals from the audit firms.
- 3.9 The scope of the audit will still be specified nationally, the National Audit Office (NAO) is responsible for writing the Code of Audit Practice which all firms appointed to carry out the Council's audit must follow. Not all audit firms will be eligible to compete for the work, they will need to demonstrate that they have the required skills and experience and be registered with a Registered Supervising Body approved by the Financial Reporting Council.
- 3.10 Currently, there are only nine providers that are eligible to audit local authorities and other relevant bodies; all of these firms have a national presence. This means that a local procurement exercise, as described immediately below, would seek tenders from these same firms, subject to the need to manage any local independence issues. Local firms could not be invited to bid.
- 3.11 Earlier this year the Council notified the LGA of its potential support for the sector led body approach. PSAA has now formally invited the Council to opt in to the sector led scheme. Details of the invitation are provided at Appendix 1 to this report. In summary the national opt-in scheme provides the following:
- The appointment of a suitably qualified audit firm for each of the five financial years commencing 1 April 2018;
 - Appointing the same auditor to other opted in bodies that are involved in formal collaboration or joint working initiatives to the extent this is possible with other constraints;
 - Managing the procurement process to ensure both quality and price criteria are satisfied. PSAA will seek views from the sector to help inform its detailed procurement strategy;
 - Ensuring suitable independence of the auditors from the bodies they audit and managing any potential conflicts as they arise;
 - Minimising the scheme management costs and returning any surpluses to scheme members;
 - Consulting with authorities on auditor appointments, giving the Council the opportunity to influence which auditor is appointed;
 - Consulting with authorities on the scale of audit fees and ensuring these reflect scale, complexity and audit risk; and
 - Ongoing contract and performance management of the contracts once these have been let.

Other Options

- 3.12 If the Council does not opt in it will need to establish an independent auditor panel. In order to make a stand-alone appointment the auditor panel would need to be set up by the Council itself. The members of the panel must be wholly or a majority of independent members as defined by the Act. Independent members for this purpose are independent appointees, this excludes current and former elected members (or officers) and their close families and friends. This means that elected members will not have a majority

input to assessing bids and choosing which audit firm to award a contract for the Council external audit. Recruitment and servicing of the Auditor Panel, running the bidding exercise and negotiating the contract is estimated by the LGA to cost in the order of £15,000 plus on going expenses and allowances.

- 3.13 Alternatively the Act enables the Council to join with other authorities to establish a joint auditor panel. Again this will need to be constituted of wholly or a majority of independent appointees (members). The costs of setting up the panel, running the bidding exercise and negotiating the contract would be shared across a number of authorities. There is greater opportunity for negotiating some economies of scale by being able to offer a larger combined contract value to the firms. However further legal advice would be required on the exact constitution of such a panel having regard to the obligations of each Council under the Act and the Council would need to liaise with other local authorities to assess the appetite for such an arrangement.
- 3.14 Neither of these options is recommended. Both these options would be more resource-intensive processes to implement and without the bulk buying power of the sector led procurement, would be likely to result in a more costly service. It would also be more difficult to manage quality and independence requirements through a local appointment process.
- 3.15 Regulation 19 of the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015 requires that a decision to opt in must be made by a meeting of the Council (meeting as a whole). The Council then needs to formally respond to PSAA's invitation in the form specified by PSAA by early March.
- 3.16 PSAA will commence the formal procurement process after this date. It expects to award contracts in summer 2017 and consult with authorities on the appointment of auditors so that it can make an appointment by the statutory deadline of December 2017.

4. RATIONALE

- 4.1 The Audit & Governance Committee, in its role of providing an independent and high-level focus on the audit, assurance and reporting arrangements that underpin good governance and financial standards, is required to oversee external audit, helping to ensure efficient and effective assurance arrangements are in place.
- 4.2 The work of external audit forms a key element of the Council's overall system of internal control. Effective external audit arrangements promote best practice and improvements in the management of risks and value for money. A key requirement for the Audit & Governance Committee, in order for the Committee to meet its Terms of Reference, is to assess the adequacy of the external audit provision.

5. KEY ISSUES AND RISKS

- 5.1 The principal risks are that the Council fails to appoint an auditor in accordance with the new frameworks or does not achieve value for money in the appointment process. These risks are considered best mitigated by opting in to the sector led approach through PSAA.

- 5.2 A sector-wide procurement conducted by PSAA will produce better outcomes and will be less burdensome for the Council than any procurement undertaken locally. More specifically:
- The audit costs are likely to be lower than if the Council sought to appoint locally, as national large-scale contracts are expected to drive keener prices from the audit firms;
 - Without the national appointment, the Council would need to establish a separate independent auditor panel, which could be difficult, costly and time-consuming;
 - PSAA can ensure the appointed auditor meets and maintains the required quality standards and can manage any potential conflicts of interest much more easily than the Council; and
 - Supporting the sector-led body will help to ensure there is a vibrant public audit market for the benefit of the whole sector and this Council going forward into the medium and long term.
- 5.3 If the Council is to take advantage of the national scheme for appointing auditors to be operated by PSAA for the subsequent years, it needs to take the decision at the Council Forum in January or Finance Council in February to enable it to accept the invitation by early March 2017.

6. POLICY IMPLICATIONS

- 6.1 To meet its terms of reference the Audit & Governance Committee needs to assess the adequacy of the external audit provision.

7. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 7.1 There is a risk that current external fees levels could increase when the current contracts end in 2018.
- 7.2 Opting-in to a national scheme provides maximum opportunity to ensure fees are as low as possible, whilst ensuring the quality of audit is maintained by entering in to a large scale collective procurement arrangement.
- 7.3 If the national scheme is not used some additional resource may be needed to establish an auditor panel and conduct a local procurement. Until a procurement exercise is completed it is not possible to state what, if any, additional resource may be required for audit fees for 2018/19.

8. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

- 8.1 Section 7 of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 requires a relevant Council to appoint a local auditor to audit its accounts for a financial year not later than 31 December in the preceding year. Section 8 governs the procedure for appointment including that the Council must consult and take account of the advice of its auditor panel on the selection and appointment of a local auditor. Section 8 provides that where a relevant Council is a local Council operating executive arrangements, the function of appointing a local auditor to audit its accounts is not the responsibility of an executive of the Council under

those arrangements.

- 8.2 Section 12 makes provision for the failure to appoint a local auditor: the Council must immediately inform the Secretary of State, who may direct the Council to appoint the auditor named in the direction or appoint a local auditor on behalf of the Council.
- 8.3 Section 17 gives the Secretary of State the power to make regulations in relation to an 'appointing person' specified by the Secretary of State. This power has been exercised in the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015 (SI 192) and this gives the Secretary of State the ability to enable a Sector Led Body to become the appointing person. In July 2016 the Secretary of State specified PSAA as the appointing person.

9. RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

There are no resource implications to opting in to the national scheme. If the national scheme is not used some additional resource may be needed to establish an auditor panel and conduct a local procurement.

10. EQUALITY IMPLICATIONS & HEALTH IMPLICATIONS

There are no equality or health implications arising as a result of this report.

11. CONSULTATIONS

Director of Finance & IT, Chief Executive, Deputy Chief Executive

Contact Officer: Colin Ferguson, Head of Audit & Assurance – Ext: 5326

Date: 30 December 2016

Background Papers: New Arrangements for External Audit, noted at the Audit Committee meeting of 20 September 2011.

DCLG: Government response to the Future of Local Audit

DCLG: Future of local public audit – consultation: summary of responses

Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 (the Act).